

Xavier Calvez Chief Financial Officer ICANN

7 February 2022

Dear Xavier,

Statement of the Generic Names Supporting Organization Council on ICANN's Draft FY23-27 Operating & Financial Plan + Draft FY23 Operating Plan & Budget

The Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO) Council welcomes the opportunity to provide input on those aspects of the draft FY23-27 Operating & Financial Plan ("FY23 OFP") including the draft FY23 Operating Plan & Budget ("FY23 Budget") that are of relevance to the GNSO Council's remit, which are managers of the policy development process for generic top-level domains. Thus, while this statement is made on behalf of the GNSO Council, our comments are intended to complement, and not replace, any input that may be provided by individual GNSO Stakeholder Groups and Constituencies.

This comment was prepared by the Council's Standing Committee on Budget and Operations (SCBO), whose membership includes both Councilors and Subject Matter Experts from across the GNSO. The SCBO focused its efforts on exploring whether or not the resources directed at policy development are appropriate, both in relation to current workload, and in view of planned policy activities for FY23 and the risks or threats to the fulfillment of the GNSO Council's responsibilities within ICANN's larger mission and remit.

General Comments:

- As we have mentioned in previous comments, as part of its review, the GNSO Council examines the proposed budget to understand what resources have been allocated to each GNSO Stakeholder Group, and to the other Supporting Organizations and Advisory Committees. The GNSO Council understands that ICANN Finance & Planning "acknowledges the [GNSO Council's] request to understand resources allocated to each SO/AC and [ICANN Org is] planning to provide that information in a future version of the Budget." Although we have budget experts drawn from the various GNSO constituencies as part of the SCBO, we find it is difficult (as noted in prior comment submissions) without greater detail to approximate the levels of financial support provided directly and indirectly to the various Supporting Organizations, Advisory Groups, and associated Stakeholder Groups and Constituencies. For instance, it would be important for the GNSO Council to understand the percentage of budget resources for Policy Development and Advice that was dedicated to the GNSO. Such information is essential for each of these groups, including the GNSO Council to hold ourselves, and others, mutually accountable to responsibilities, and expected level of performance and efficiency as good stewards of the funds allocated to these groups.
- It has also been mentioned in past comments that the GNSO Council seeks to ensure that the annual Operation and Financial Plans and annual Budgets provide Working Group Chairs with tools and support to ensure effective and efficient leadership. We were pleased to be informed that the enterprise-wide project management software has been purchased, and to see the planned addition of two full-time employees since the adopted FY22 FTE levels. In addition, the GNSO Council is informed that certain

specific expenses for important policy-making tools, such as software and consultants, are covered in areas of the budget that appear well-funded.

Specific Comments Related to the draft FY23-27 Operating & Financial Plan:

In the GNSO Council's comments on the Five Year Strategic and Operating Plan ("5YS&OP") it identified the following specific issues that are applicable to the FY23 OFP:

- Evolve and Strengthen the Multistakeholder Model to Facilitate Diverse and Inclusive Participation in Policymaking
 - OFP Issue 1. Maintain adequate staffing for Policy Development Support. In its review of each OFP, the GNSO Council seeks to ensure that the OFP is providing sufficient personnel and non-personnel resources for the policy development and implementation activities. The FY23 OFP indicates that "the FY23 level of resources is generally expected to be consistent with the current level of staff, assuming that FY22 hiring requests are fulfilled and continuing ability to rely on professional services contractors for additional needs." In FY23 the level of resources allocated to this Functional Activity indicates 36 FTE and \$8.0M USD, which is an increase of 2 FTEs since 2022 and an increase of \$0.9M USD in personnel expenses. The GNSO is pleased to see the planned addition of staff.

The two additional staff will be critically important to ensure that there is adequate support for policy development and implementation efforts. However, neither the FY23 OFP nor FY23 Budget provide insight for their readers into the factors analyzed by ICANN org to determine if staffing is adequate. Moreover, the FY23 OFP correctly identifies that (i) the need for data-driven policymaking results in requests for more robust data collection and analysis as well as external experts to aid in policy development; (ii) policy challenges (such as the SSAD) facing the community are becoming more legally and technically complex; and (iii) the growing complexity of the issues along with their broad impact and diversity of stakeholder interests (e.g., on data privacy and DNS abuse) means that significant time and effort needs to be expended on understanding the issue and multiple viewpoints in order to find consensus. In addition, the GNSO Council would point out that the following work is forecasted for the FY23 time frame:

					- Finish				01 0	1 00 0	1 OI	22 (1)	01 01	ez <u>03 04 01 62 63 04 01 62 63 64 01 62 63 04 6</u> 1	
4	NA	EPOP_P2	PCT: Daniardiand Dynam for Access & Disclosure - Phase 2	06/31/22	05/27/24	Not Diarted	Planel	Cartellular						RT: Standar&ard System for Access & Dis	dosus - Phere
6	NA	EPOP, PIA	IRT: Registration Data - Phase 2A	09/07/22	04/28/23	Not Started	Planed	Contributor						RT Reportation Cole - Phase 26	
8	NA	EPOP_P1	IRT: Temporary Epecification on gTLD Registration Data - Phase 1	0010100	06/30/23	In Progress	Revised Schedule	Certificator						IRT: Temperary Specification on gPLD Reportation Data - Phone	
06	NA	WPIAD	Request KANN org to develop revised proposal for involving Procedure	10/16/00	101622	On Hold	0-00	Contributor						Request CANN orgin develop revised proposal for involving Procedure	
DIS	NA	WPIAG	Engage WHAD	02/01/23	042523	Not Diarted	Planel	Owner						Engage #FIAD	
05	NA	WPAG	EPOP: Procedure for Handling Whois Conflicts with Privacy Law	06/29/23	100123	Not Started	Planned	Owner						EPDP: Procedure for Handing Whois Conflicts with Price	eyter
66	NA	PPIN	PCT: Privary & Proxy Benkies Accreditation Issues	06/16/21	11/16/22	In Progress	Revised Schedule	Certificator						IRT: Privacy & Proxy Services Azoreditation Issues	
05	NA	TAT	IRT: Translation/Transitionation of gTLD Registration Data	06/16/21	11/16/22	In Program	Ranbed Schedule	Contributor						IRT: Translation Transitionation of gTLD Registration Cele	
206	NA	RDA_87	Repibhation Data Accuracy - Borging Team	001201	11/14/22	In Progress	OrbiteUs	Owner						Registration Data Adouracy - Scoping Team	
05	NA	RDA, IR	Staft Issue Report on Registration Data Accuracy	12/27/22	050123	Not Started	Planed	Owner						Elian Insue Report on Repirtution Data Accuracy	
	NA	8PM,P1	IRT: RPM - Phase 1 Review of FPMs in ALgTLDs	02/01/22	43/13/23	Not Started	Planed	Cortelautor						ERT: RPM - Phase 1 Pavies of RPMs in All gTLDs	
	NA	RFM,P2	Drafting Team: Charter on Roview of UDRP (incl. Itema 2 through 11 of Rec27 Wave1)	04/08/22	110322	Not Started	Planed	Owner						Drafting Team Charler on Review of UDRP (rist. Items 2 Brough 11 of Res27 Mil	
	NA.	RPM_P2	PDP: RPM - Phase 2 Review of UDRP	110422	110724	Not Diarted	Planet	Owner						POP. RPM - Phase 2 Review of	9900
u .	NA	5utPro	Board: New gFLD Subsequent Procedures Operational Design Phase	09/13/21	1013/22	In Program	On-Schedule	Contributor						Board New gTLD Subsequent Projectures Operational Design Prace	
LD	NA	5-879	Board: New gPLD Exberguent Procedures adopt consensus recommendations	00/22/21	010123	In Progress	On Bahelula	Cartellular						Board: New gTLD Subsequent Piscedules adopt conservus recommendation	
10	NA	5utPro	RT: New gTLD Subsequent Procedures	02/01/23	822525	Not Started	Planned	Curebutur						URT: New pTLD Buttorp	ant Precedures
10	NA	EPOP.JDN	EPDP: Internationalized Domain Names	05/20/21	06/16/23	In Progress	On Schedule	Owner						EPOP: Internationalized Dismain Names	
piration	NA.	PSR, EPR	Develop Expiration Policy Status Report (not. Rec27 Wave1 EDDP Item 2 + ERRP Item3)	08/25/22	05/03/23	Not Started	Planned	Contributor						Develop Dopination Pylicy Status Report (Incl. Rec2T Wave1 EDDP In	en 2 + ERRP de
aroles	NA	199UP1	PDP: Transfer Policy Review - Phase 1	02/18/21	122623	In Progress	On-Balantula	Owner						PDP. Transfer Policy Review - Phase 1	
	NA	£P0P,50RP,100	Board: Specific Curative Rights Protections for ISOs adopt consensus recommendations	05/10/22	060122	Not Started	Planned	Contributor						Brant Specific Curative Nights Photections for IGOs adopt conservus recommendation	
	NA	EPOP,804P,300	HT: Specific Guative Rights Protections for 100s	09/02/22	061423	Not Started	Panel	Cortellular						IRT: Specific Qurative Rights Protections for KDOs	
	NA.	100_CRFM	Board: Curative Rights Protections for ISO/INSOs adopt consensus recommendations	05/10/22	060122	On Hold	0100	Contributor						Board Curative Rights Protections for IQO/NDOs adopt opracticus recommendations	
	NA	IOO_CRPM	IRT: Curative Rights Protections for KOO/NGOs	08/02/22	06/14/23	Not Started	Panel	Contributor						IRT. Cuastve Rights Protections for IOD/1NDDs	
	NA	100_N002	Doard. Protection of International Organization Names in Atl g/LDs (Remaining-Acronyms)	05/10/22	060122	On Hold	0-001	Contributor						Board Protection of Edemational Departmetion Names in All off-Ds (Remaining Actionym	-0
	NA	100_N002	IRT. PDP. Protection of International Organization Names in All gTLDs (Remaining Aconymo)	08/02/22	061423	Not Started	Famel	Contributor						97. POP. Polector of international Digarization Barries in A	gTLDs (Netwo
countability	NA	W92	GNSO Council & SQIC Implementation of WS2	05/34/31	010123	In Programs	On-Schedule	Owner						CAIGO Council & SG/C Implementation of WS2	
mentability	NA	MSM_Eve	Council to monitor for MSM-Evo implementation assignments	0010100	210125	In Progress	On-Bahelule	Contributor						Counted to manual	
deus	NA	ATRTS	Council to monitor for ATRT3 implementation assignments	000100	12/13/23	In Progress	On-Batheaute	Contributor						Council to monitor for ATRT3 implementation assignment	679
rteus	NA	5512	Council to monitor for SDR2 implementation assignments	00/10/21	12/12/23	In Programs	On-Bahelule	Contributor						Council to monitor for SSR2 implementation assignment	ria I
deus	NA	Holicic, Plot	Holistic Review Plot - GNSO participation	08/12/22	092423	Not Started	Planed	Cortebutor						Holatic/Review Pild - GMBO participation	
erations	Continuous Improvement	CC01C1	CCDICI Piel Pregram	06/16/21	310122	In Progress	On-Schedule	Owner						CODICI Plus Program	
erations	Leadership	GNSO_C	GNSO Council - Monthly Meetings	0033/20	067326	In Progress	On-Batheoute	Owner							ON50 C
arations	Laudership	GNSO_C	0NSO Ceurci - Leadeship Meetings	0015300	051526	In Programs	On-Balancia	Owner							GNS0 C
erationa	Laadenhip	GNSO_C	ONSO Council - Action Items	0013/00	06/17/26	In Program	On-Baheaute	Owner							09990
verationa	Butori	8080	ONSO Standing Committee on FY24 Budget and Operations 2022-2023	110122	42/13/23	Not Started	Flexed	Owner						ONSIC Standay Committee on FY24 Budget and Operations 2022-2022	
eratione	Electors Nominations	890	(INSO Standing Selection Committee 2021-2022	10/27/21	110422	In Progress	Planed	Owner						CRISTO Standing Selection Committee 2025-2022	
verations	Electors, Nominations	890	GNSO Standing Selection Committee 2022-2023	09/21/22	990323	Not Started	Percel	Owner						GREED Standing Selection Committee 2022-2023	
erations	Planning	5P3 2023	0N3O Council - Strategic Planning Service - 2022 2023	10/01/22	010623	Not Started	Planed	Owner						01450 Council - Strategic Planning Seasion - 2022-2023	
eratione	ICANN Meetings	ICANN?4	ICANNUT# Respond to GAC Advice	09/17/22	2207012	Not Darted	Parrel	Owner						ICASPUTE Respond to DAC Advice	
erations	ICANN Meetings	ICANN?5	CANV75 Meeting Planning	060102	297322	Not Started	Planed	Owner						CAAB/75 Meeting Planning	
anationa	ICANN Meetings	(CANN/75	CANN'TS ICANN Meeting	09/14/22	09/20/22	Not Started	Percel	Owner						CANADS CANN Meeting	
erations	ICANN Meetings	ICMNP5	ICANN/75 Respond to GAC Advice	09(21)(22	10/11/22	Not Started	Parrel	Owner						I ICANNTS Respond to GAC Advice	
erations	CAN Meetings	CANN 76	CANNTS Meeting Planning	120102	151523	Act Started	Parcel	Owner						SCANS/18 Meeting Planning	
erationa	ICANN Meetings	(CANN PR	CANN'S CANN Meeting	00198(23	232323	Not Started	Planet	Owner						CANNON ICANN Meeting	
anationa	ICANN Meetings	ICANN'N	CANN'S Beaund in DAC Advice	092923	14/12/23	Not Started	Parcel	Owner			-			CANN'TE Respect to GAC Advice	
eratione	CAN Medica	ICANN??	CANNY? Meeting Planning	040103	060623	Not Started	Parcel	Owner						CANBUT Meeting Planning	
analisma	CAN Meetings	1040077	CANNTT ICANN Meeting	06/99/23	061523	Not Started	Parcel	Owner						CAMP? ICAN Venting	

In light of these risk factors, the GNSO Council is happy to engage with ICANN org on the future work of the GNSO, the factors examined by ICANN org for personnel resource decisions and best-practices for project management staffing.

- Monitor Legislation, Regulation, Norms, Principles, and Initiatives in Collaboration with Others That May Impact the ICANN Mission
 - OFP Issue 2: With respect to the section in the FY23-27 OFP, How Progress is Tracked, the GNSO recommends that ICANN Org includes a goal to publish reports on the number of in-country engagements by ICANN Org/Affiliates at Fora (e.g., Internet Governance Forum) where potentially impactful issues are discussed, such as cybersecurity, data protection, privacy, cultural and geographic identifiers, emerging technologies, and proposed new systems of unique identifiers.
- Planning at ICANN
 - OFP Issue 3. Strategic priority should be given to collaboration between the GNSO Council, ICANN Org's Policy Development Support and the ICANN Board and Community on prioritization and planning for anticipated future work. In its comments on the FY22 OFP, the GNSO Council noted that there had been no increase in the FY22 OFP as it pertains to resources dedicated to collaboration and planning for future ICANN Policy Work. Like the FY22 OFP, the FY23 OFP provides no detail concerning resources dedicated to planning because "Resources for this initiative are included within the functional activities of the financial plan". These activities are especially critical as in FY23 ICANN will implement the draft prioritization plan during the planning process of the FY24 OFP. The GNSO Council was pleased to see those additional resources for the Policy Development and Advice Functional Activity. However, no further details are provided as to where these additional resources will be drawn from, such as the Supplemental Fund for Implementation of Community Recommendations (SFICR), the IT budget or contingency budget.

Specific Comments related to the draft FY23 Operating Plan & Budget:

In the GNSO Council's comment on the FY23 Budget, the following issues were identified:

- Policy Development and Advice
 - Budget Issue 1. Maintain adequate non-personnel resources for Policy Development Support. In the GNSO Council's comment on the FY22 Budget, we pointed out that the initiatives, tools and resources associated with PDP 3.0 should be explicitly individualized in the activities to enable the GNSO Council to adequately evaluate whether the recommended changes associated with PDP 3.0 were being adequately funded. As mentioned in the General Comments, the GNSO Council acknowledges that most of PDP 3.0 has been implemented and that its various tools and resources are covered by the Policy Development and Support Functional Activity section of the FY23 Budget, and, in particular, the Technical Services and Contingency subsections. The GNSO

Council will continue to provide a review and analysis of these budget sections on a recurring annual basis.

Budget Issue 2. Maintain adequate staffing for Policy Development Support. In the GNSO's comment on the FY22 Budget, the GNSO Council remarked that with respect to Policy Development the total budget for FY21 was the same as for FY20, \$6.9M and 35 FTE. The GNSO Council was pleased to see that 36 FTE are budgeted. In the joint meeting between the GNSO Council's Standing Committee on Operations and Budget (SCBO) and the ccNSO Strategic and Operational Planning Committee (SOPC), there was discussion with the ICANN Finance & Planning team concerning these committees gaining a better understanding of the process and factors that ICANN org undertakes to determine staffing needs. The SCBO looks forward to engaging with ICANN Finance and planning and the SOPC on this topic in the future.

Conclusion

The GNSO Council appreciates this opportunity to share our perspectives on these important issues. As the GNSO is a part of the Empowered Community we look forward to reviewing all inputs from the public comment process which addresses ICANN's broader strategy and budget. Finally, the GNSO Council would be happy to answer any clarifying questions that you may have regarding the contents of this document.

Yours sincerely,

Philippe Fouquart GNSO Council Chair